

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com

ScienceDirect

Review Article

Organic functionalization of metal catalysts: Enhanced activity towards electroreduction of carbon dioxide

Jigang Wang^{1,3}, Fengqi Zhang^{1,3}, Xiongwu Kang¹ and Shaowei Chen^{1,2}

Abstract

Electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide has been attracting extensive interest due to its fundamental significance both in environmental protection and in energy storage. In this review, recent progress in the manipulation of the catalytic activity and selectivity of various transition metals towards CO₂ reduction reaction (CO₂RR) is summarized within the context of deliberate surface functionalization by select organic ligands. This is primarily manifested in three effects, interfacial charge transfer, suppression of hydrogen evolution, and stabilization of key reaction intermediates. The review is concluded with a perspective of the challenges and promises in the structural engineering of metal catalysts for enhanced CO₂RR performance.

Addresses

Guangzhou Key Laboratory for Surface Chemistry of Energy Materials, New Energy Research Institute, School of Environment and Energy, South China University of Technology, Guangzhou Higher Education Mega Centre, Guangzhou 510006, China ² Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of California, 1156 High Street, Santa Cruz, CA 95064, United States

Corresponding authors: Chen, Shaowei (shaowei@ucsc.edu); Kang, Xiongwu (esxkang@scut.edu.cn) ³ Equal contributing authors.

Current Opinion in Electrochemistry 2019, 13:40-46

This review comes from a themed issue on Physical and nanoelectrochemistry

Edited by Michael Mirkin

For a complete overview see the Issue and the Editorial

Available online 24 October 2018

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.coelec.2018.10.010

2451-9103/© 2018 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

Keywords

CO₂ reduction. Transition metal. Surface functionalization. Geometrical effect, Interfacial charge transfer.

The concentration of carbon dioxide (CO_2) in the earth's atmosphere has been increasing drastically since the era of industrial revolution, due to massive consumption of fossil fuels, which contributes significantly to global warming and abnormal global climate [1,2]. Electrochemical reduction of CO2 to fuels is believed to be a

promising route to the mitigation of such climate hazards [3-7], thanks to its high efficiency, controllable selectivity, simple electrochemical reactors and enormous potential for practical industrial applications. Importantly, the conversion of CO2 to fuels also allows for sustainable energy conversion and storage. Yet, CO₂RR involves rather complicated reaction mechanisms, and includes a wide range of final products, such as CO, methane, ethylene, formic acid, and alcohols [8-12]. Also, because of high chemical stability of CO₂ molecules, CO₂RR is kinetically sluggish. Therefore, to facilitate the reaction, it is necessary to develop high-performance, robust catalysts. This necessitates a good understanding the reaction mechanism of CO₂RR. Extensive research has shown that CO₂RR involves at least three key sequential steps: (i) adsorption of CO₂; (ii) surface diffusion of CO_2 , and electron and proton transfer to CO_2 ; and (iii) desorption of products [13-17]. Of these, step (ii) is generally believed to be the rate-determining step (RDS) [18,19]. Tafel slope is an important experimental parameter in the study of CO₂RR mechanism. For instance, a Tafel slope of ca. 120 mV/dec typically suggests that RDS involves the first one-electron reduction of adsorbed CO_2 to form the CO_2^{*-} intermediate, whereas a Tafel slope of ca. 60 mV/dec suggests that RDS is likely the protonation of CO_2^{*-} [20–23].

Transition metals have played a critical role in CO₂RR. Prior research has shown that the electrocatalytic activity of metal (nanoparticle) catalysts depends on the catalyst structure, morphology, and elemental composition, as highlighted in a series of recent reviews [24-26]. Remarkably, recent research has also shown that deliberate surface engineering of the metal catalysts with select organic capping ligands can also be exploited as a new, effective strategy in manipulating the CO₂RR activity [27-30-], as motivated by breakthroughs in a range of important reactions in electrochemical energy conversion and storage, such as formic acid oxidation and oxygen reduction reactions [31-38]. In this minireview, we will summarize the latest, key research progress of CO₂RR based on surface functionalization of several leading metal catalysts (i.e., Au, Ag, Pd, and Cu) with organic capping ligands, and conclude with a perspective of the significance of surface engineering of nanoparticle

catalysts for enhanced CO₂RR performance.

Gold has been found to exhibit apparent activity towards CO₂RR. In one study, Mikoshiba et al. [28•] modified a Au electrode with a self-assembled monolaver (SAM) of thiol-terminated imidazolium ion through Au-S interfacial bonds (Figure 1a). CO₂RR on the bare Au electrode yielded only CO, while the SAM-modified one produced ethylene glycol instead with a maximum faradaic efficiency (FE) of 87%. The authors also observed an exponential decay of the CO₂RR current density with the chainlength of the thiol ligands, signifying that the reduction current density of the SAM-modified electrode was dominated by electron tunneling through the surface capping ligands. Mechanistically, this involved the formation of an imidazolium-carboxylate intermediate, which not only reduced the energy barrier of CO₂RR but also suppressed hydrogen evolution reaction (HER), a significant interference in CO₂RR. In another study, Fang et al. [30••] investigated and compared the CO₂RR activity of a Au electrode before and after functionalization with three thiol derivatives: 2-mercaptopropionic acid (MPA), 4-pyridinylethanemercaptan (PEM), and cysteamine (CYS). It was found that the PEM-Au electrode showed a two-fold increase in FE and three-fold increase in formate production, relative to bare Au. By sharp contrast, the MPA-Au electrode exhibited minimal CO₂RR activity with almost 100% FE for hydrogen evolution, while the CYS-Au electrode increased both CO and H₂ production by two folds. By analyzing the correlation between the difference of the onset potentials of HER and CO₂RR and the surface concentration ratio of H^+ to CO_2 using the Butler-Volmer relationship, it was found that the product selectivity of CO2RR was strongly dependent on the local pH at the electrode surface, which was related with the dissociation of hydrated cations and the pKa of the MPA, PEM and CYS ligands. The enhanced current density and selectivity of formate production catalyzed by the PEM-Au electrode was ascribed to the separated proton and electron transfer reactions enabled by the PEM ligands, analogous to the catalytic actions of enzymes [39]. Specifically, on the PEM-Au electrode surface, a proton from the aqueous solution was first reduced forming an H-atom adsorbed on Au, and the electrophilic attack of CO₂ to the adsorbed H yielded HCO2*. Next, the tethered

Figure 1



(a) Schematic of Au electrodes modified with 1-methylimidazolium-terminated SAMs (IL-2, IL-6, IL-8, and IL-12). Reproduced with permission from Ref. [28•] © 2015, Royal Society of Chemistry. (b) Proposed reaction mechanism on the PEM-modified Au surface. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [30••] © 2017, American Chemical Society. (c) Schematic of carbene ligand exchange reaction on Au nanoparticle surface. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [40••] © 2016, American Chemical Society.

pyridinium (pyrH⁺) in the thiolate group transferred a proton to the nearby oxygen of the HCO_2^* coupled with one-electron transfer from the electrode surface. Based on such an analysis, the proton donating ability (i.e., pK_a) of the capping ligands was proposed to be correlated with the formate and H₂ production for CO₂RR on SAM-functionalized Au electrodes, as shown in Figure 1b.

In another study by Chang and coworkers $[40 \bullet \bullet]$, it was found that surface functionalization of Au nanoparticles with a N-heterocyclic carbene (NHC) (Figure 1c) increased FE of CO₂RR to CO from 53% to 83% and current density by 7.6-fold at the overpotential of 0.46 V,

Figure 2





(a) Schematic of CO_2RR on amine- and thiol-capped Ag nanoparticles. Variation of CO FE of OLA, OA and DDT Ag/C with (b) the applied voltage and (c) fixed potential. Mass activity for (d) H₂ and (e) CO production of OLA, OA and DDT Ag/C at varied applied potentials. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [41•] © 2017, American Chemical Society.

Ag is also active towards CO_2RR . For instance, Hwang and co-workers [41•] developed an effective strategy to tune the electrocatalytic activity and selectivity of Ag towards CO_2RR by modulating the binding energies of the intermediates on the catalyst surfaces with the assistance of capping agents, such as oleylamine (OLA), oleic acid (OA), and dodecanethiol (DDT), as shown in Figure 2. They found that amine-functionalized Ag nanoparticles delivered a high FE of 94.2% for CO production by selectively suppressing HER, while thiol-functionalized Ag nanoparticles actually increased the HER activity. Density functional theory (DFT)



Figure 3

(a) Synthetic scheme for the preparation of tripodal N-heterocyclic carbenes and functionalization of palladium surfaces. (b) CV scans of Pd and Pd-timtmb^{Me} electrodes in CO_2 -saturated 0.5 M KHCO₃. (c) Specific current densities of C1 product by Pd and Pd-timtmb^{Me} electrodes. (d) Controlled potential electrolysis of Pd-mimtmb^{Me} and Pd-timtmb^{Me} electrodes at -0.57 V over a 6 h time course. (e) Tafel plots of Pd and Pd-timtmb^{Me} electrodes. Reproduced with permission from Ref. [42] © 2018, Wiley.

calculations showed that the amine-capping ligands stabilized the COOH intermediate, destabilized hydrogen binding and effectively suppressed HER, while thiol-functional ligands indiscriminately increased both HER and CO_2RR , which lowered the FE for CO production.

Pd represents another unique catalyst for CO₂RR. For instance, the Chang group [42] observed enhanced CO₂RR activity and selectivity of a Pd foil electrode by functionalization with tridentate NHC derivatives (Pd-timtmb^{Me}, Pd-timtmb^{iPr} and Pd-timtmb^{tBu}, where timtmb was 1,3,5-tris(1-alkylimidazoliummethyl)-2,4,6trimethylbenzene, and Me, iPr and tBu were the substituent groups on the NHC ligand) (Figure 3a). Experimentally, it was found that the Pd-timtmb^{Me} electrode exhibited a 32-fold increase in the activity of CO₂RR to C1 products with an FE of 86%, as compared to that without surface functionalization (FE = 23%) (Figure 3b and c). In fact, all three substituent groups of Me, iPr and tBu modulated the selective production of C1 products of CO₂RR. In addition, the Pd electrode functionalized with tridentate NHC ligands exhibited much enhanced stability, as compared to that with monodentate NHC (Pd-mimtmb^{Me}, where mimtmb was 2-(1alkylimidazoliummethyl)-1,3,5-trimethylbenzene)

(Figure 3a,d). Theoretical calculations showed that the energy barrier of the formation of COOH* was 0.85 eV for Pd-timtmb^{Me}, much lower than that for the naked Pd surface (1.23 eV), suggesting more energetically favored formation of COOH* on Pd-timtmb^{Me}. In addition, the Pd foil electrode exhibited a Tafel slope of 157 mV/dec, signifying that the RDS was the formation of CO_2^{--} , whereas the Tafel slope for Pd-timtmb^{Me} was only 85 mV/dec, suggesting that the CO₂RR kinetics was largely dictated by the protonation of CO_2^{*-} (Figure 3e). Again, this was accounted for by the strong σ -donation from the NHC ligands to Pd that effectively tuned the formation of CO₂RR.

Cu also plays an important role in CO₂RR. Research has shown that functionalization of Cu surface with select ligands can stabilize adsorbed intermediates (e.g., CHO, COH, etc) over CO, leading to improved selectivity of hydrocarbon production [43]. For instance, Wang and coworkers [29••] developed a general approach based on amino acid modified-Cu electrodes for the selective electroreduction of CO₂ to hydrocarbons. To demonstrate the validity of this modification approach and to rule out possible effects of Cu morphology, the authors examined three different types of Cu electrodes, i.e., a Cu nanowire film, a polished Cu foil, and an annealed Cu electrode. For all three electrodes, amino acid modification was found to suppress HER and improved the efficiency of the total generation of hydrocarbons. Theoretical calculations showed that the formation of hydrogen bond between CHO^{*} and $-NH_3^+$ of In summary, recent research, highlighted by the studies cited above, has shown that surface functionalization of metal (nanoparticle) catalysts with select organic ligands can be exploited as a new, effective strategy in the manipulation of CO_2RR activity and selectivity, in addition to the conventional variables of size, shape and elemental composition. This is generally ascribed to three major effects, manipulation of the electron density of the catalyst surface by interfacial charge transfer, suppression of H₂ generation, and stabilization of key reaction intermediates (e.g., CHO* on Cu, COOH* on Ag and Pd, and HCOO* on Au).

It should be noted that prior research is mostly confined to these four metal catalysts. Thus, to further enhance the electrocatalytic performance, more in-depth investigations are desired by extending the studies to other metals and their alloys. In addition, it is critical to develop advanced in situ/operando characterization techniques, such as in situ FTIR and X-ray absorption spectroscopy, to unravel the mechanistic insights of the impact of surface functionalization of metal catalysts on the CO₂RR activity and selectivity, which, in conjunction with results from theoretical calculations, will advance our understanding of the reaction pathways. This will allow for the development of a fundamental framework for the design and engineering of highperformance catalysts for CO₂RR. The breakthroughs may be further aided by the availability of a diverse range of metal-organic bonds, such as metal-carbon $(M-C, M = C \text{ and } M \equiv C)$, metal-nitrogen (M-N, M)M = N, metal-sulfur (M-S) and metal-silicon (M-Si) bonds, that have been readily formed in organometallic complexes and metal nanoparticles [32]. Further research along this line is desired.

Conflict of interest statement

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported, in part, by the US National Science Foundation (CHE-1710408).

References

Papers of particular interest, published within the period of review, have been highlighted as:

- of special interest of outstanding interest
- Yang HQ, Xu ZH, Fan MH, Gupta R, Slimane RB, Bland AE, Wright I: Progress in carbon dioxide separation and capture: a review. J Environ Sci 2008, 20:14–27.
- Mikkelsen M, Jorgensen M, Krebs FC: The teraton challenge. A review of fixation and transformation of carbon dioxide. Energy Environ Sci 2010, 3:43–81.

- Habisreutinger SN, Schmidt-Mende L, Stolarczyk JK: Photo-3 catalytic reduction of CO₂ on TiO₂ and other semiconductors. Angew Chem Int Ed 2013, 52:7372-7408.
- Appel AM, Bercaw JE, Bocarsly AB, Dobbek H, DuBois DL, Dupuis M, Ferry JG, Fujita E, Hille R, Kenis PJA, *et al.*: **Frontiers,** 4 opportunities, and challenges in biochemical and chemical catalysis of CO2 fixation. Chem Rev 2013, 113:6621-6658.
- Ozin GA: Throwing new light on the reduction of CO₂. Adv Mater 2015, 27:1957–1963. 5.
- Liu LJ, Li Y: Understanding the reaction mechanism of photocatalytic reduction of CO₂ with H_2O on TiO₂-based 6. photocatalysts: a review. Aerosol Air Quality Res 2014, 14: 453-469.
- Sharma PP, Zhou XD: Electrocatalytic conversion of carbon 7. dioxide to fuels: a review on the interaction between CO₂ and the liquid electrolyte. WIRES Energy Environ 2017, 6:239.
- Lv K, Fan Y, Zhu Y, Yuan Y, Wang J, Zhu Y, Zhang Q: Elastic Ag-anchored N-doped graphene/carbon foam for the selec-8. tive electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide to ethanol. J Mater Chem A 2018. 6:5025-5031.
- Hoang TTH, Verma S, Ma S, Fister TT, Timoshenko J, Frenkel AI, Kenis PJA, Gewirth AA: Nanoporous copper-silver alloys by additive-controlled electrodeposition for the selective elec-9 troreduction of CO2 to ethylene and ethanol. J Am Chem Soc 2018, 140:5791-5797.
- 10. Gao D, Zhou H, Wang J, Miao S, Yang F, Wang G, Wang J, Bao X: Size-dependent electrocatalytic reduction of CO2 over Pd nanoparticles. J Am Chem Soc 2015, 137:4288-4291
- 11. Jiang B, Zhang XG, Jiang K, Wu DY, Cai WB: Boosting formate production in electrocatalytic CO2 reduction over wide po-tential window on Pd surfaces. J Am Chem Soc 2018, 140: 2880-2889
- Zhu W, Zhang L, Yang P, Chang X, Dong H, Li A, Hu C, Huang Z, Zhao ZJ, Gong J: Morphological and compositional design of Pd-Cu bimetallic nanocatalysts with controllable product selectivity toward CO₂ electroreduction. Small 2018, 14: 1703314
- 13. Costentin C, Robert M, Saveant JM: Catalysis of the electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide. Chem Soc Rev 2013, 42:2423-2436
- 14. Qiao JL, Liu YY, Hong F, Zhang JJ: A review of catalysts for the electroreduction of carbon dioxide to produce low-carbon fuels. Chem Soc Rev 2014, 43:631-675.
- 15. Albo J, Alvarez-Guerra M, Castano P, Irabien A: Towards the electrochemical conversion of carbon dioxide into methanol. Green Chem 2015, 17:2304-2324.
- 16. Lu Q, Jiao F: Electrochemical CO2 reduction: electrocatalyst, reaction mechanism, and process engineering. Nano Energy 2016, 29:439-456.
- 17. Kumar B, Brian JP, Atla V, Kumari S, Bertram KA, White RT, Spurgeon JM: New trends in the development of heteroge neous catalysts for electrochemical CO₂ reduction. Catal Today 2016, 270:19-30.
- 18. Gao S, Lin Y, Jiao X, Sun Y, Luo Q, Zhang W, Li D, Yang J, Xie Y: Partially oxidized atomic cobalt layers for carbon dioxide electroreduction to liquid fuel. Nature 2016, 529:68-71.
- 19. Zhu DD, Liu JL, Qiao SZ: Recent advances in inorganic heterogeneous electrocatalysts for reduction of carbon dioxide. Adv Mater 2016, 28:3423-3452.
- 20. Gu J, Heroguel F, Luterbacher J, Hu X: Densely packed, ultra small SnO nanoparticles for enhanced activity and selectivity in electrochemical CO2 reduction. Angew Chem Int Ed 2018, 57:2943-2947.
- 21. Duan YX, Meng FL, Liu KH, Yi SS, Li SJ, Yan JM, Jiang Q: Amorphizing of Cu nanoparticles toward highly efficient and robust electrocatalyst for CO₂ reduction to liquid fuels with high Faradaic efficiencies. Adv Mater 2018, 30 1706194.

- 22. Sekar P, Calvillo L, Tubaro C, Baron M, Pokle A, Carraro F, Martucci A, Agnoli S: Cobalt spinel nanocubes on N-doped graphene: a synergistic hybrid electrocatalyst for the highly selective reduction of carbon dioxide to formic acid. ACS Catal 2017, 7:7695-7703.
- 23. Zhang S, Kang P, Meyer TJ: Nanostructured tin catalysts for selective electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide to formate. J Am Chem Soc 2014, 136:1734-1737.
- 24. Vickers JW. Alfonso D. Kauffman DR: Electrochemical carbon dioxide reduction at nanostructured gold, copper, and alloy materials. Energy Technol 2017, 5:775-795.
- 25. Wu JH, Huang Y, Ye W, Li YG: CO2 reduction: from the electrochemical to photochemical approach. Adv Sci 2017, 4, 1700194.
- 26. Zhou J-H, Zhang Y-W: Metal-based heterogeneous electrocatalysts for reduction of carbon dioxide and nitrogen: mechanisms, recent advances and perspective. React Chem Eng 2018, 3:591-625.
- 27. Kim C, Jeon HS, Eom T, Jee MS, Kim H, Friend CM, Min BK, Hwang YJ: Achieving selective and efficient electrocatalytic activity for CO₂ reduction using immobilized silver nano-particles. J Am Chem Soc 2015, **137**:13844–13850.

CO₂RR overpotential of Ag nanoparticles directly grown on carbon support was Significantly reduced due to Ag-S interfacial interactions with the cysteamine anchoring ligands.

 Tamura J, Ono A, Sugano Y, Huang C, Nishizawa H, Mikoshiba S: Electrochemical reduction of CO₂ to ethylene glycol on imidazolium ion-terminated self-assembly monolayer-modified Au electrodes in an aqueous solution.
Phys Chem Chem Phys 2015, 17:26072–26078.
CO₂ reduction field was in the imidazolium ion monolayer, rather than

on the gold electrode surface.

Xie MS, Xia BY, Li Y, Yan Y, Yang Y, Sun Q, Chan SH, Fisher A, 29. Wang X: Amino acid modified copper electrodes for the enhanced selective electroreduction of carbon dioxide towards hydrocarbons. Energy Environ Sci 2016, 9:1687-1695.

In this work, the authors developed a general approach based on amino acid modification of Cu electrodes for the selective electroreduction of CO₂ towards hydrocarbons.

Fang YX, Flake JC: Electrochemical reduction of CO2 at 30. functionalized Au electrodes. J Am Chem Soc 2017, 139: 399 - 3405

This paper proposes a proton-induced desorption mechanism where the pK_a of the organic capping ligand is responsible for the dramatic selectivity changes.

- 31. Chen S, Zhao Z, Liu H: Charge transport at the metal-organic interface. Annu Rev Phys Chem 2013, 64:221-245.
- 32. Hu PG, Chen LM, Kang XW, Chen SW: Surface functionalization of metal nanoparticles by conjugated metal-ligand interfacial bonds: impacts on intraparticle charge transfer. Acc Chem Res 2016, 49:2251-2260
- Zhou ZY, Kang X, Song Y, Chen S: Butylphenyl-functionalized palladium nanoparticles as effective catalysts for the electrooxidation of formic acid. Chem Commun 2011, 47: 6075-6077.
- Zhou Z-Y, Kang X, Song Y, Chen S: Ligand-mediated electro-catalytic activity of Pt nanoparticles for oxygen reduction reactions. J Phys Chem C 2012, 116:10592–10598.
- 35. Zhou ZY, Ren J, Kang X, Song Y, Sun SG, Chen S: Butylphenylfunctionalized Pt nanoparticles as CO-resistant electrocatalysts for formic acid oxidation. Phys Chem Chem Phys 2012, 14:1412-1417.
- 36. Zhou ZY, Kang X, Song Y, Chen S: Enhancement of the elec-trocatalytic activity of Pt nanoparticles in oxygen reduction by chlorophenyl functionalization. Chem Commun 2012, 48: 3391-3393.
- 37. Kang X, Chen S: Electronic conductivity of alkyne-capped ruthenium nanoparticles. Nanoscale 2012, 4:4183-4189.
- Kang X, Zuckerman NB, Konopelski JP, Chen S: Alkyne-func-38. tionalized ruthenium nanoparticles: ruthenium-vinylidene

bonds at the metal-ligand interface. *J Am Chem Soc* 2012, **134**: 1412–1415.

- Weinberg DR, Gagliardi CJ, Hull JF, Murphy CF, Kent CA, Westlake BC, Paul A, Ess DH, McCafferty DG, Meyer TJ: Proton-coupled electron transfer. *Chem Rev* 2012, 112: 4016–4093.
- Cao Z, Kim D, Hong D, Yu Y, Xu J, Lin S, Wen X, Nichols EM, Jeong K, Reimer JA, et al.: A molecular surface functionalization approach to tuning nanoparticle electrocatalysts for carbon dioxide reduction. J Am Chem Soc 2016, 138: 8120–8125.

Results from this study demonstrate that molecular surface functionalization can be exploited as a complementary approach to size, shape, composition, and defect control for the rational design and engineering of nanoparticle catalysts towards CO_2RR . Kim C, Eom T, Jee MS, Jung H, Kim H, Min BK, Hwang YJ: Insight into electrochemical CO₂ reduction on surfacemolecule mediated Ag nanoparticles. ACS Catal 2017, 7: 779–785.

This study demonstrates that the catalytic activity and selectivity of electrochemical CO_2 reduction can be modulated through judicious choice of the functional groups of the capping ligands.

- Cao Z, Derrick JS, Xu J, Gao R, Gong M, Nichols EM, Smith PT, Liu X, Wen X, Coperet C, et al.: Chelating N-heterocyclic carbene ligands enable tuning of electrocatalytic CO₂ reduction to formate and carbon monoxide: surface organometallic chemistry. Angew Chem Int Ed 2018, 57:4981–4985.
- Peterson AA, Nørskov JK: Activity descriptors for CO₂ electroreduction to methane on transition-metal catalysts. J Phys Chem Lett 2012, 3:251–258.